Journal Pre-proof

Implications of a highly convective lunar magma ocean: Insights from phase equilibria modeling



K.A. Cone, S.M. Elardo, F.J. Spera, W.A. Bohrson, R.M. Palin

PII:	S0019-1035(25)00176-9
DOI:	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2025.116629
Reference:	YICAR 116629
To appear in:	Icarus
Received date:	31 January 2025
Revised date:	18 April 2025
Accepted date:	27 April 2025

Please cite this article as: K.A. Cone, S.M. Elardo, F.J. Spera, et al., Implications of a highly convective lunar magma ocean: Insights from phase equilibria modeling, *Icarus* (2024), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2025.116629

This is a PDF file of an article that has undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but it is not yet the definitive version of record. This version will undergo additional copyediting, typesetting and review before it is published in its final form, but we are providing this version to give early visibility of the article. Please note that, during the production process, errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

© 2025 Published by Elsevier Inc.

Implications of a highly convective lunar magma ocean: Insights from phase equilibria modeling

K.A. Cone^{a,b}, S.M. Elardo^c, F.J. Spera^d, W.A. Bohrson^a, R.M. Palin^e

^aDepartment of Geology and Geological Engineering, Colorado School of Mines, CO, USA ^bDepartment of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Rochester, NY, USA ^cDepartment of Geological Sciences, University of Florida, FL, USA ^dDepartment of Earth Science and Earth Research Institute, University of California, Santa Barbara, USA ^eDepartment of Earth Sciences, University of Oxford, UK

Corresponding author and current address: Kim A. Cone (kimacone@gmail.com), Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY, USA

Abstract

The Moon's internal structure was largely defined within the first 200 million years following the initial Moon-forming impact. During this period, the lunar magma ocean (LMO) lost most of its heat through early vigorous convection, crystallizing and forming an initial cumulate stratigraphy through, potentially, robust equilibrium crystallization followed by fractional crystallization once the LMO became sufficiently viscous. This rheological transition is estimated to have occurred at 50% to 60% LMO solidification, and although the petrological effects of the regime switch have been frequently investigated at the lower value, such effects at the upper limit have not been formally examined until now. Given this scenario, we present two new internally consistent, high-resolution models that simulate the solidification of a deep LMO of Earth-like bulk silicate composition at both rheological transition values, focusing on the petrological characteristics of the evolving mantle and crust. The results suggest that increasing the volume of early suspended solids from the oft-examined 50% to 60% may lead to non-trivial differences. The appearance of minor mantle garnet without the need to invoke a refractoryelement enriched bulk silicate Moon composition, a bulk mantle relatively richer in orthopyroxene than olivine, a lower density upper mantle, and a thinner crust are shown to change systematically between the two models, favoring prolonged early crystal suspension. In addition, we show that late-stage, silica-enriched melts may not have sufficient density to permit plagioclase to continue building a floatation crust and that plagioclase likely sinks or stagnates. As the ability of a lunar magma ocean to suspend crystals is directly tied to the Moon's early thermal state, the degree of early LMO convection - and the immediate Solar System environment that drives it - require as much consideration in LMO models as more wellinvestigated parameters such as bulk silicate Moon composition and initial magma ocean depth.

Keywords

Moon, lunar magma ocean, lunar petrology, lunar evolution, lunar crust

1. Introduction

One of the most profound consequences of the high-energy, Moon-forming giant impact was the molten state the Moon assumed immediately afterward (e.g. Canup and Asphaug, 2001; Canup, 2004; Cuk and Stewart, 2012; Lock et al., 2018, 2020), commonly referred to as the lunar magma ocean (LMO). Subsequent cooling of the LMO over tens of millions to possibly hundreds of millions of years (Elkins-Tanton et al., 2011; Maurice et al., 2020) led to densitydriven separation of minerals from melt and eventually, a differentiated solid Moon. Cooling models for the LMO, at least from a petrological and compositional standpoint, have largely focused on the effects of various bulk silicate Moon compositions (BSMCs) and/or LMO depths on whole-Moon structure. These two parameters (along with others) are typically examined using one of two end-member crystallization models: 1) a two-stage process of equilibrium crystallization (e.g. Tonks and Melosh, 1990; Snyder et al., 1992; Elardo et al., 2011) followed by fractional crystallization, or 2) a fully fractional crystallization model (e.g. Charlier et al., 2018; Rapp and Draper, 2018; Schwinger and Breuer, 2022). The two-stage model reflects an initially robust convective regime that forces early equilibrium crystallization. Once the LMO is sufficiently crystal rich, a regime switch to fractional crystallization occurs. This rheological transition is estimated to occur at ~50 vol.% LMO solids (Tonks and Melosh, 1990; Snyder et al., 1992; Spera, 1992). However, this crystal lockup point can occur at ≥ 60 vol.% solids (e.g. Abe, 1995; Solomatov, 2007; Costa et al., 2009) if convection is significantly vigorous, the effects of which have not been modeled for the cooling of a deep LMO of Earth-like composition prior to this work.

Of the more than ~40 BSMCs considered in published literature (Cone et al., 2020; 2021 and references therein), two serve as frequently explored end-member compositions: the refractory element-enriched Taylor Whole Moon (TWM; Taylor, 1982) and the Earth-like Lunar Primitive Upper Mantle (LPUM; Longhi, 2006). Models using the TWM composition unsurprisingly produce the high-pressure, Al-bearing phase garnet when coupled with a deep LMO (i.e. >1000km depth) (e.g. Elardo et al., 2011; Jing et al., 2022; Kraettli et al., 2022; Schmidt et al., 2022), as the TWM composition is enriched in elements such as Al and Ca by 50% relative to bulk silicate Earth. Shallower LMO models do not generate garnet, as the base of the LMO would be outside the garnet stability field (e.g. Charlier et al., 2018). Models using the LPUM composition have not produced garnet in the deep mantle before the crystallization front moves to lower pressure, instead producing a lower mantle dominated by olivine and some orthopyroxene (e.g. Elardo et al., 2011; Johnson et al., 2021). The results of the Gravity Recovery and Interior Laboratory (GRAIL) mission, however, have made refractory element-enriched compositions such as the TWM untenable. The TWM composition was developed in order to explain an inferred crustal thickness of ~73 km produced from a shallow (e.g. ~500 km) LMO, which would require the LMO to be enriched in refractory elements. Crustal thickness estimates from the GRAIL mission now estimate the feldspathic crust to be ~34-43 km thick (e.g., Wieczorek et al., 2013) and modern giant impact models predict deep to whole Moon melting, thus obviating the need for refractory element enrichment. More recently, even LMO models using Earth-like compositions and a deep LMO tend to produce crustal thicknesses in excess of the geophysical estimate unless an alteration of thermal state is invoked (e.g. Charlier et al., 2018; Elardo et al., 2020). Some models also produce a silica-rich layer at the end stages of LMO solidification, which can serve to increase crustal thickness while lowering crustal density, although sample evidence for widespread quartz/silica crystallization from the LMO is lacking.

The first goal of this study was to create two LMO models that simulate the solidification of a full-depth (~1400 km) LMO using an Earth-like BSM composition (LPUM) and a two-stage crystallization regime with rheological transitions at both 50% and 60% LMO volume solids. Both models are created using the same internally consistent thermodynamic database and solidification protocol, making them directly comparable to one another. Bulk silicate Moon compositions are typically varied (holding other variables constant) in LMO models to assess the effects on whole-Moon petrological structure. Here we examine such effects due to an increase in the volume of suspended solids that characterize the first portion of the two-stage model, while holding the BSMC constant. This approach has, to our knowledge, not been explicitly explored in previous works.

The second goal of this study was to compare the results and approaches of our LPUM LMO solidification models against other works for any significant differences in inferred whole-Moon petrological structure. We characterized geochemical, petrological, and physical aspects of the modeled crusts, mantles, and crust-mantle transition zones assuming that a mantle overturn did not occur until after near-complete solidification (e.g. Boukaré et al., 2017). The results of this comparison constrain the differences in structure and composition of two primitive, differentiated lunar interiors that crystallize under two plausible durations of an early turbulent convective LMO.

2. The LMO Model: Starting Parameters and Process Flow

2.1. A Bulk Silicate Moon Composition for a Deep LMO

The TWM composition continues to be explored in recent LMO cooling models and was initially derived based on an assumption of a 73-km thick alumina-rich crust. This composition no longer serves as a compelling choice for modeling since the GRAIL-era finding for a 34-43-km thick crust. The LPUM composition used here (Longhi, 2006) reflects a primitive terrestrial upper mantle (as a modification of Hart and Zindler (1986)) and is therefore similar in major element composition to bulk silicate Earth, with the notable exception of the depletion in alkalis in the LPUM composition. In addition, giant impact modeling suggesting extreme source homogenization of the co-evolving Earth-Moon system (e.g. Lock et al., 2018; 2020) and evidence for an Earth-like Moon-forming impactor (Dauphas et al., 2014) support the use of BSMCs that are similar to bulk silicate Earth (e.g. Hauri et al. (2015) proposed a volatile-reduced version of the McDonough and Sun (1995) bulk silicate Earth).

2.2. Pressure-depth relationship

We assumed a small lunar core based on the seismic interpretations in Weber et al. (2011) and on those summarized in Garcia et al. (2019). Assuming a lunar radius of 1737.15 km (Williams et al., 2014), the core radius was set to 330 km (Weber et al., 2011), leaving an ~1400-km thick magma ocean ($D_{LMO} = ~1400$ km). LMO depth was converted to pressure (P) assuming unform spherical density (Turcotte and Schubert, 2002),

$$P = 2/3 \pi \rho_{MP}^2 G(R_{FULL}^2 - r^2)$$
 (Eq. 1)

where the mean primitive lunar density $\rho_{MP} = 3345.56 \text{ kg m}^{-3}$ (Williams et al., 2014), the universal gravitational constant $G = 6.674 \text{ x} 10^{-11} \text{ m}^3 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ s}^{-2}$, $R_{FULL} = 1737.15 \text{ km}$, and *r* is the LMO radius that varies with depth. This method of approximating changes in *P* with depth (*z*) does not consider density evolution during LMO solidification, although still provides a reasonable means for estimating a *P*-*z* profile and has been previously employed in LMO models (e.g. Elkins-Tanton et al., 2011; Fig. S1 in Supporting Information).

2.3. Phase equilibria characteristics

All phase equilibria were calculated using the Gibbs free energy minimizer Perple_X (version 6.9.0; Connolly, 2005; 2009), an internally consistent thermodynamic dataset (hp633ver.dat; Holland and Powell, 2011; Holland et al., 2018), and relevant solid solution models (Jennings and Holland, 15; Green et al., 2016; Holland et al., 2018; White et al., 2000; 2014) over the P-Tconditions relevant to LMO depths. Melt and solid phases (olivine (OL), orthopyroxene (OPX), garnet (GT), spinel (SP), clinopyroxene (CPX), plagioclase (PL), ilmenite (ILM), quartz (QTZ), and a potassic feldspar sanidine (SAN)) were considered in the anhydrous nine-component SiO₂-MgO-FeO-Al₂O₃-CaO-Cr₂O₃-TiO₂-Na₂O-K₂O system, listed here in order of decreasing wt.% oxide. Perple_X utilizes a gridded minimization approach where phase boundaries are continuously refined according to user-defined resolution settings (cf. Connolly, 2005; 2009). A summary of the solid solution models and grid resolution settings are included in Supporting Information (Fig. S2). Phase boundary uncertainties within a single phase-diagram are estimated at ± 1 kbar and $\pm 50^{\circ}$ C at the 2σ level (Powell and Holland, 2008; Palin et al., 2016). FeO was the only form of iron oxide considered for a silicate LMO at or below an IW buffer (Sato et al., 1973; Papike et al., 2015). The geikielite endmember of the ilmenite solid solution model was excluded in our calculations due to reports that it becomes overstabilized at high temperature conditions (Green et al., 2016).

2.4. Pressure-temperature conditions for crystallization

The lunar mantle is assumed to have solidified from the 'bottom-up' as crystallization proceeds (e.g. Solomatov, 2000; Elkins-Tanton, 2012) and *P-T* values were approximated using linear adiabats calculated for each cooling step. The LMO was treated as a quasi-isothermal system wherein large-scale vigorous convection produces a well-stirred LMO, thereby efficiently distributing heat from top to bottom. As adiabatic slopes for an initially hot, small silicate body like the Moon are expected to be steep (e.g. Tonks and Melosh, 1990), the temperature

difference between the LMO surface and base would be insignificant over the 1400-km LMO depth. The adiabatic change in temperature with pressure was approximated by

$$\frac{dT}{dP} = \alpha V T_{BASE} C_p^{-1}$$
(Eq. 2)

where α is the coefficient of thermal expansion, *V* is specific volume, T_{BASE} is the base temperature of a well-stirred LMO, and *Cp* is the LMO heat capacity. Values for these parameters were determined by Perple_X.

2.5. Process flow: Convection and crystallization regimes

We modeled the effects of a solidifying full-depth LMO after core formation using the two-stage model. Stage one reflected a magma ocean that vigorously convects until 50% or 60% solids (referred to as the EQX50 and EQX60 models, respectively) are achieved, after which stage two simulated fractional crystallization until the LMO is fully solid (referred to as the EQX50 and EQX60 models, respectively). We chose a two-stage model over a fully fractional model due to initial constraining assumptions that suggest an early turbulent regime (Tonks and Melosh, 1990; Spera, 1992; Garcia et al. 2019): 1) the LMO begins as a low viscosity, ultramafic melt; 2) the Moon is a small body with low gravitational acceleration (1.6 m s⁻² at the surface) and so is conducive to extended crystal suspension; and 3) heat loss is efficient due to the temperature contrast between the LMO base (~2200 K) and the free surface where the temperature of space is ~240 K. All of these factors promote turbulence.

The 60 vol.% rheological lockup value represents an estimate of maximum crystal loading for early vigorous convection. A quantitative scaling analysis is here expressed as a dimensionless number, R, that compares crystal settling velocity against vertical convective velocity:

$$R = \frac{\Delta \rho g d^2 L}{18 \kappa \eta_{melt}} R a^{-3/7} (1 - \theta)^m \left[\frac{(1 - \theta)}{(1 - (\theta/\theta_0))} \right]^{\frac{3C\theta_0}{7(1 - \theta_0)}}$$
(Eq. 3)

where $\Delta \rho$ is the mean crystal-melt density difference, *g* is gravitational acceleration, *d* is the mean crystal diameter, *L* is the LMO depth, κ is thermal diffusivity, η_{melt} is dynamic viscosity, *m* is the exponent of reduction, θ is crystal fraction, and *Ra* is the Rayleigh number based on melt viscosity. This scaling suggests that a crystal fraction of 0.64 is a reasonable high-end estimate (Fig. 1). The most important conclusion drawn from Equation 3 is that the regime change from zero crystal settling to efficient sedimentation occurs just below the value of critical packing in the vicinity of θ_{o} . Although other parameters play a role, the singularity in the two-phase viscosity function at $\theta = \theta_o$ serves as the dominant predictor. A discussion of the derivation and considerations for estimating the catastrophic crystal loading fraction are provided in the Supporting Information file.



Figure 1. Dimensionless *R*-value (y-axis) represents a settling-to-convective RMS velocity ratio. Here the catastrophic solid fraction is $\theta = 0.64$.

Although crystallization along the entire depth of the LMO column is possible, an adiabat need not lie perfectly parallel to the liquidus (Tonks and Melosh, 1990; Spera, 1992), and temperature decreases occur throughout early convection due to efficient heat loss through the free surface. To simulate the petrological evolution of the LMO as it cools and crystallizes, stable phase assemblages were calculated for discrete spherical shells over the 1400-km depth. For the equilibrium crystallization portions of the models (Stage 1 in Fig. 2), mineral and melt characteristics were predicted over 1 to 45000 bar, in ~2500-bar thick shells (18 total shells), along two adiabats that represents ~50% or ~60% solid. Each shell's equilibrium phase assemblage was estimated using the shell's mean P and T. The solids were then assumed to settle to the core-mantle boundary and incorporate 3% trapped melt, which is within the range suggested by Snyder et al. (1992). These settled solids represent the initial deep mantle cumulate pile, and establish a base above which subsequent fractional crystallization occurs (Stage 2 in Fig. 2). A new LMO bulk melt composition was then computed.

Stage 2 equilibrium phase assemblages were calculated for the new LMO depth range in ~1000bar thick shells, the exception being the uppermost shell that included any remaining LMO in a <1000-bar thick shell. The first adiabat was chosen based on the new thermodynamic melt properties determined by Perple_X such that <~3 vol.% LMO solids were produced. The solids were then dropped onto the existing cumulate mantle pile along with 3% trapped melt, thus building upward the cumulate mantle front. A new LMO bulk melt composition was then computed for the next fractional crystallization layer and a new adiabat determined from the new thermodynamic melt properties that produced <~3 vol.% LMO solids. This process repeated until the LMO was fully solid. Perple_X output was used to track phase volume, composition, and density.

Journal Pre-proof

During the fractional crystallization stages, solid-melt density contrasts determined if crystals float or sink. Plagioclase has often been treated as a persistently buoyant phase during lunar crust formation (e.g. Elkins-Tanton et al., 2011; Johnson et al, 2021), adding to crustal thickness by underplating which progressively lowers the upper pressure-depth boundary. If our models produced a late-stage, silica-rich LMO melt at the base of the crust, any co-crystallizing plagioclase may not float or separate efficiently. However we considered the possibility of both scenarios, regardless of solid-melt density contrast, in order to compare the results to previous works. Model closure occurred when the combined total thickness of the floated plagioclase crust and the cumulate mantle equaled 1737.15 km and the LMO was fully solid. Layer thicknesses were calculated based on 3-D spherical volumes. Figure 2 shows the sequence of the two-stage 50% model, general characteristics, and expected phases with respect to a ~200-million-year solidification period as an example (Maurice et al., 2020; as an example for a long-lived LMO) and LMO vol.% solidification. Table 1 contains starting parameters and parameter abbreviations for both the EQX50 and EQX60 models.



Figure 2. A schematic of the two-stage 50% LMO model. EQX = equilibrium crystallization, FRX = fractional crystallization. **c** and **d** show expected stable phases formed during the stages, the darker lower portion of **d** signifying the first appearance of cpx. Ilmenite forms late in LMO cooling (**e**), and a stagnant plagioclase lid (**f**) begins to form shortly before the first appearance of ilmenite. **g** represents the timing for a mantle overturn that can only begin after completion of **a**. Yellow and light gray arrows in **b** represent the simultaneous sinking of late-stage mafic phases and ilmenite and the floatation of plagioclase, respectively. The KREEP-rich transition zone (K, rare earth elements, and P) represents a residual LMO rich in incompatible elements and does not have a distinct boundary. Here the zone is associated with the appearance of ilmenite. **p** = plagioclase, ol = olivine, opx = orthopyroxene, cpx = clinopyroxene, gt = garnet, sp = spinel, qtz = quartz (or other silica phase).

Table 1

Parameters for EQX solids

Description	Symbol	Value
Bulk silicate Moon composition ^a	BSMC (LPUM)	wt.% oxide
SiO ₂		46.1
MgO		38.3
FeO		7.62
Al_2O_3		3.93
CaO		3.18
Cr_2O_3		0.5
TiO ₂		0.17
Na ₂ O		0.05
K_2O		0.003
Mean lunar radius ^b	R_{FULL}	1737.15 km
Mean core radius ^c	R_{CORE}	330 km
Depth-dependent LMO radius	r	< 1737.15 km
Full lunar volume	V_{FULL}	$2.1958 \times 10^{10} \text{ m}^3$
Core volume	V_{CORE}	1.5053 x 10 ⁸ m ³
LMO full volume	V_{LMO}	$2.1808 \times 10^{10} \text{ m}^3$
Gravitational constant	G	$6.674 \times 10^{-11} \mathrm{m^3 kg^{-1} s^{-2}}$
Mean lunar density ^b	$ ho_M$	3345.56 kg m ⁻³
LMO heat capacity ^d	Ср	EQX50: 357.08 J K ⁻¹ EQX60: 313.37 J K ⁻¹
LMO thermal expansivity ^d	α	EQX50: 7.0775 x 10 ⁻⁵ K ⁻¹ EQX60: 7.1982 x 10 ⁻⁵ K ⁻¹
LMO specific volume ^d	V	EQX50: 6.8483 J bar ⁻¹ EQX60: 6.1947 J bar ⁻¹
LMO base pressure ^e	P_{BASE}	45000 bar
LMO base temperature ^d	T_{BASE}	EQX50: 2044 K EQX60: 1994 K
LMO surface pressure	P_{SURF}	1 bar
LMO starting depth	Z_{LMO}	1407.15 km
Adiabat ^d	dT/dP	EQX50, EQX60: ~28 K/GPa

^aLonghi (2006). ^bWilliams et al. (2014). ^cWeber et al. (2011). ^dDerived from Perple_X; a single set of values are used for the equilibrium crystallization portion of the models, and again recalculated at the onset of each fractional crystallization layer. ^eApproximation derived from Eq. 1.

3. Results

3.1. Equilibrium crystallization

The LPUM isochemical phase diagram (Fig. 3) shows the stability of mineral and melt phases over the depth range of the LMO. The curves represent total volumes of 50% and 60% equilibrium crystallization solids for the EQX50 (yellow line) and EQX60 (white line) models, respectively. Our results indicate that the EQX60 adiabat, but not the EQX50 adiabat, intersects the garnet stability field at the highest LMO pressures, creating a zone with a small amount of primary garnet at the base of the LMO during this stage.



Figure 3. A pseudosection for the LPUM bulk silicate Moon composition over the range of pressures from the LMO surface to core-mantle boundary (~45000 bar) to approximately the lunar core center (~50000 bar). Both adiabats are steep and reflect an ~28K increase with every 1 GPa increase.

Our calculations show that EQX regimes produce mantles comprised of olivine (OL), orthopyroxene (OPX), and garnet (GT), with minor (0.03 vol.%) spinel (SP) stable only within a single shell at ~221 km-depth in the EQX60 model. The EQX50 model produced a cumulate mantle with a larger ratio of olivine to orthopyroxene (3.8) than the EQX60 model (2.7). Olivine and orthopyroxene Mg# (= molar 100*[Mg/(Mg+Fe)]) ranged from 92-95 and 94-95 for the EQX50 and EQX60 models, respectively. For both models, orthopyroxene and olivine equilibrated toward the base of the LMO are less Mg-rich, more Fe-rich, and denser than those

equilibrated toward the LMO surface due to the higher degree of solidification at higher pressures. Garnet in the EQX60 model stabilized at the LMO base and up through ~39000 bar (~1000-km depth). The amount produced in our models is small versus the full LMO volume but constitutes ~5 vol.% of the lower ~200 km of LMO solids.

We assumed a well-mixed mantle at the end of the EQX stage and estimated a bulk density based on the volumetric contributions of solid phases from each shell, all of which were denser than the melt environment. Similar bulk densities of 3150 and 3167 kg m⁻³ resulted for the EQX50 and EQX60 models, respectively. Without garnet, the EQX60 model bulk solid density was ~3155 kg m⁻³. Figures 4 and 5 summarize these results, and Table 2 shows the three melt compositions (the starting LPUM, after 50% solids are removed, and after 60% solids are removed) with trends pointing to increases in all the LPUM components as equilibrium crystallization progresses, with the exception of MgO. Finally, the two models produce different cumulate pile heights, the surfaces of which rest at ~339 and ~259-km depth for the EQX50 and EQX60 models, respectively.



Figure 4. Relative vol.% of the three major solid phases that appear during the equilibrium crystallization stages of the two models, as a function of 18 shells. The line with circle markers represents the temperatures used for each shell's *P*-*T* calculation and corresponds to the vertical axis on the right. The lower black curve represents the vol.% solids produced by each shell along the adiabat.



Figure 5. Schematic of key differences between early equilibrium crystallization characteristics of the two models. ϕ = crystal fraction of the LMO solidified. Cumulate pile bulk mineralogy and trapped melt percents (versus the full LMO) in yellow text, bulk residual LMO melt composition (FRX melt) wt.% is in white text.

Table	2
-------	---

Bulk compositions (wt. %) of equilibrium crystallization melts and solids

Stage	SiO ₂	Al_2O_3	Cr_2O_3	TiO ₂	FeO	MgO	CaO	Na ₂ O	K_2O	Mg#
Start (LPUM)	46.100	3.930	0.500	0.170	7.620	38.300	3.180	0.050	0.003	90
EQX50 end melt	47.901	7.365	0.761	0.345	10.010	27.184	6.328	0.100	0.006	83
EQX60 end melt	48.113	8.373	0.763	0.415	10.271	24.424	7.512	0.122	0.008	81
EQX50 bulk solid	44.586	0.730	0.260	0.006	5.401	48.776	0.238	0.003	0.000	94
EQX60 bulk solid	44.965	1.096	0.331	0.013	5.940	47.238	0.409	0.004	0.000	93

Figure 6 compares the LMO melt composition at the end of the EQX stages from this work against four others all using LPUM but different convective regimes, LMO starting depths, and crystallization *P*-*T* paths: 1) Elardo et al. (2011) used an experimental approach considering four different pressures (1, 2, 3, and 4 GPa) and melt fractions from 20% to 75% for a 1400-km deep LMO; 2) Charlier et al. (2018) experimentally modeled the cooling of a 600-km deep LMO using a purely fractional crystallization model considering five different pressures from 0.08 to 1.20 GPa; 3) Rapp and Draper (2018) also created a fully fractional model but for a ~1400-km deep LMO over eight different pressures from 0.5 GPa to 4 GPa; and Johnson et al. (2021) employed computational phase equilibria to simulate a solidifying 1400-km deep LMO, using 50 mol.% as a proxy for 50 vol.% in attempting to reproduce the work of Elardo et al. (2011).



Figure 6. A comparison of published LMO melt compositions across works that considered an LPUM bulk silicate Moon, after ~50 vol.% solids are precipitated. Charlier et al. (2018) and Rapp and Draper (2018) used a fully fractional crystallization model whereas the others employed a two-stage model.

3.2 Fractional crystallization

3.2.1 Evolution of melt composition

The two fractional crystallization regimes of the EQX50 and EQX60 models (FRX50 and FRX60, respectively) produce similar melt composition trends (Fig. 7): SiO₂ increases with increasing formation of solids whereas FeO, Al₂O₃, and CaO steadily increase until plagioclase saturates at ~77-78% solids, at which point CaO and Al₂O₃ decrease and FeO increases further. At ~96-98% solids, the LMO is quartz saturated and FeO concentrations sharply decrease. Although the melt compositions of the two models trend similarly with respect to the cumulative volume of LMO solids produced, the trends may be offset by depth (e.g. peak melt FeO content occurs at ~77 km depth in the EQX50 model and at ~73 km in the EQX60 model). Inflections near 50% and 60% volumes are a result of the abrupt transition from equilibrium to fractional crystallization inherent in the models.

The last three shells of melt (the last shell being frozen in place immediately under the crust) in both models reflect melt densities that should inhibit efficient plagioclase flotation (plagioclase would be neutrally to negatively buoyant). This point is later discussed in context of crustal properties.



Figure 7. Compositional melt evolution as a function of LMO vol.% solidification. Melt composition curves for the full model, where the last step is frozen in place. The shaded area represents 75% to ~100% LMO solids, emphasizing element trends after plagioclase has stabilized.

3.2.2 Solid phase characteristics

Figure 8 shows the proportion of solid phases formed within each of the vertical depth-based packets of the FRX portions of the models (i.e. before crystal settling). Figure 9 shows relative mineral abundances and their depths after crystal settling. Orthopyroxene (opx) initially cocrystallizes with olivine, and opx proportions increase until clinopyroxene (cpx) stabilizes, at which point opx decreases and cpx increases. Ilmenite (ilm) appears in both models over similar mantle layer thicknesses (~32 km), but at different depths (ilm in FRX50 settles to a depth of \sim 93 km and to \sim 88 km in FRX60). The volumetric contribution for both models is 0.11% versus V_{LMO} and is also similar at 2.1-2.2 vol.% versus the KREEP layer in which it resides. Spinel is dispersed over a thicker portion of mantle in FRX50 (~123 km) versus FRX60 (~75 km) and also at a greater depth in the former (~280 km versus 223 km). A second appearance of olivine occurs at ~98-99 vol.% LMO solids and is volumetrically greater in FRX60 (Fig. 7, labeled OL_U). For both models, sanidine only appears in the very last sub-crustal layer, and quartz contributes to the bottom 11-12 km of the crust. In general, the lower portion of FRX shells are ol and opx rich whereas the upper portion is cpx rich. Both models produce similar thicknesses of cpx+ilmbearing mantle (82-84 km) and the first appearance at depth-of-settling is 144 km versus 137 km in FRX50 and FRX60, respectively.



Figure 8. Mineral proportions per shell for each model where FRX50 has 25 layers and FRX60 has 22 layers (the crust is omitted here). The black dotted line represents the cumulative percent of LMO solids as a function of increasing shell# where shell# 1 is the FRX base and the highest numbered shell is the final, immediately sub-crustal shell that freezes in place.

The most significant difference thus far between the FRX portions of the models is the depths at which minerals settle or at which plagioclase-melt density contrasts first become apparent. We initially treated plagioclase as efficiently floating throughout fractional crystallization (as have previous works) and then considered plagioclase that eventually becomes neutrally to negatively buoyant (Fig. 10). In FRX50, this density inversion occurs at 71 km below the LMO surface whereas in FRX60, the same inversion occurs at 64-km depth. Such a scenario has implications for lower crust mineralogy and density as well as for compositional variations in the very upper portions of the mantle (Fig. 11).



Figure 9. FRX50 and FRX60 plots showing the relative solid phase distributions as a function of depth. A potassium feldspar phase (sanidine) appears only in the last step of fractional crystallization where the remaining LMO (<1%) is frozen in place immediately under the crust. Markers for plagioclase and quartz indicate their occurrences in the last layer crystallized.



Journal Pre-proof

Figure 10. Upper mantle and crust characteristics. Left column: major element composition. Center column: density profiles of the mantle, the crust, and the melts at both the base and surface of each FRX step in which the solids first crystallized. Here quartz is incorporated with plagioclase as basal crust. Right column: density profiles of typically non-buoyant minerals after settling. Bulk solid (ext) = density profile if plagioclase is treated as negatively buoyant, as predicted in Perple_X. Yellow dots represent the approximate depths to which negatively buoyant plagioclase sinks. An = molar $100 \times (Ca/(Ca+Na))$. Quartz density remains constant at ~2551 kg m⁻³ (not shown).

In terms of general density trends, both models produce mantle densities that increase at a roughly linear rate with progressive crystallization toward the LMO surface, increase again at the base of the transition zone and then sharply decline at the upper transition zone due to the presence of quartz. The crusts are predominantly anorthite with ~1-km thick section that include plagioclase An₈₇₋₈₈ and ~10-12 vol.% quartz (Fig. 12). Between this section and the anorthite are quartz-rich layers (~50 vol.%) ~10-11-km thick. Variations in plagioclase densities are minor (~2703 to 2715 kg m⁻³). The complete EQX50 model results in a crust that is ~5 km thicker than that produced by the EQX60 model (61 km versus 56 km).



Figure 11. Bulk solid compositions of the upper mantle reflecting late-stage plagioclase sinking.

Current seismic models suggest a largely uniform mantle density from ~80 km down to ~1200 km and a crust that increases in density with depth (e.g. Weber et al., 2011; Garcia et al., 2019). Well-mixed equilibrium crystallization regimes produce initially uniform mantle densities by default (here ~3150-3170 kg m⁻³) but less than that of Weber et al. (2011; ~3400 kg m⁻³). Both models produced crustal thicknesses well in excess of current geophysical estimates. However, given that the nearside-derived GRAIL-era estimate of a 34–43-km thick crust relied in part on assumptions of physical characteristics of two specific nearside locales, a more accurate global thickness remains to be evaluated after a farside geophysical assessment by the Seismic Suite (FSS) experiments at the South Pole-Aitkin basin (Panning et al., 2022).

For mantle depths down to ~80 km, Wieczorek et al. (2013) predicted densities from 3360–3150 kg m⁻³ assuming uniform upper mantle porosity (they argued that a deeply impact-fractured crust may also have a fractured upper mantle). Our models produce greater mantle densities (~3400-3600 kg m⁻³) down to ~80 km but match the Wieczorek et al. densities at greater depths (from ~100 km to > 200 km). This mismatch, along with density increases in Fe-bearing solid phases during progressive LMO solidification, provides further evidence for a cumulate mantle mixing event.

Garcia et al. (2019) noted a low velocity zone at depths from 100–250 km, potentially caused by proximity to heat producing KREEP. We note that this region strongly overlaps with the FRX60 lower boundary at ~260-km depth, up to the base of the transition zone (the latter serving as a KREEP layer analogue) at ~100 km. Our models show that this region could be interpreted as an initially lower-velocity one, at least relative to the overlying IBC/transition layer. Determining if the base of such a low-velocity zone could represent a relict equilibrium-to-fractional crystallization interface or even survive a cumulate mantle (CMO) requires further investigation.



Figure 12. Schematic of the crust portions of the models. Lower dotted region indicates the presence of quartz.

The two models presented here reflect fully solidified, pre-overturn, ancient lunar interiors composed of four density and composition sub-structures: 1) an ol>opx lower cumulate mantle of largely uniform density and randomized distribution of early-formed mafic phases with Mg# > 90; 2) a stratified upper mantle of ol>opx \approx cpx>sp that increases in density toward the transition zone; 3) a cpx+ilm transition zone that further increases in both density and FeO concentration toward a quartz-rich, low-density, base crust; and 4) a mostly uniformly dense, high-An bulk

crust (An_{97–98}). We underscore that although density and composition trends are similar between the models, the major inflection points in these trends occur at different depths.

The depth at which fractional crystallization (i.e. the rheological transition) begins constrains the initial thickness, density, and composition of the bulk lower mantle. In this case, bulk lower mantle densities vary only slightly (the EQX50 lower mantle is 3150 kg m⁻³ versus 3167 kg m⁻³ for the EQX60 model), and the residual LMO is slightly more Mg-enriched in the former by ~3 wt.%. The KREEP-bearing transition zones are similar in thickness and composition but occur over different depths. The crust is 5 km thinner in the EQX60 model yet given the current estimate of a 34-43 km lunar crust, the difference may not be insignificant. Garnet appears in the EQX60 model's basal mantle but not in the EQX50 model.

4. Discussion

We compare our two new models against previous results (Fig. 13). LPUM and non-LPUM compositions, shallow and deep magma oceans, two-stage to purely fractional crystallization, and a range of crustal thicknesses and cumulate mantle stratigraphies are represented. It is not within the scope of this work to examine all petrological differences across the eleven models. The pronounced differences and similarities, the general effects of parameter choice, and the inherent challenges with LMO modeling methods and related conclusions are highlighted.

4.1. Implications for crustal thickness and composition

In both of our new models, solid-melt density contrasts suggest that crystallizing plagioclase should sink or stagnate during the late stages of crustal underplating. In the EQX50 model, stagnation would initiate at ~70 km (i.e. plagioclase is no longer positively buoyant when it crystallizes at ~70 km) and in the EQX60 model, at ~64 km. This density inversion has potentially two major effects: 1) increasing alumina concentration in the upper mantle from 1-2 wt.% to 11-13 wt.%, and 2) reducing lower crust density by introducing a guartz-rich residuum. However, previous LMO models have generally defined the lunar crust as constructed by plagioclase that remains persistently and positively buoyant throughout formation. If it is to be argued that solid-melt phase density contrast is the primary mechanism for building the Moon's plagioclase crust, then we find that most published two-stage models have either not adequately addressed or have entirely ignored the effects of a late-stage, low density melt on crustal formation, even in models that produce late-stage silica-rich melts (e.g. Charlier et al., 2018; Johnson et al., 2021). Sub-crustal quartz would be expected to - if it survives significant displacement and/or re-equilibration by a mantle overturn – contribute to reduced seismic wave speed signatures near the base of the crust. If physically mixed with an upper mantle of maficdominated composition, a transition zone may yield seismic signatures closer to that of a plagioclase-dominated crust.

Currently there is no sample evidence for sub-crustal primary LMO quartz (e.g. Moriarty III et al., 2021). Any LMO quartz found on the lunar surface would have to had survived excavation via a large impactor such as the one that created the South Pole-Aitkin basin (e.g. Melosh, 2017). Even if excavated quartz survived the heat of such a large impactor, having been sourced from greater depths (e.g. Hurwitz and Kring, 2014), the quartz ejecta would then need to have survived melt sheet temperatures potentially in excess of that for quartz melting (~1650°C).

Although purely speculative, it may be the case that only minor amounts of quartz were originally excavated, and subsequent impact gardening combined with higher melt sheet temperatures obliterated or obscured obvious traces of any primary quartz on the lunar surface. Ti-in-quartz thermobaromtery coupled with, for example, computational phase equilibria constraints on Ti-saturation at depth could help elucidate the formation depths of lunar quartz.

In general, deep-LMO models (>1000 km) tend to produce crustal thicknesses in the range of ~50-60 km, far thicker than the current GRAIL-based estimate of 34-43 km, rendering the 10-km difference as potentially significant. If plagioclase stagnates or sinks, as found in both our models, then that plagioclase either sinks so slowly that it becomes part of an extended crust with quartz and minor mafic components, or it sinks quickly enough to form a separate plagioclaserich layer in the mantle. In the case of the latter, the proper flotation crust would be ~48-km thick in the EOX50 model and \sim 43-km for the EOX-60 model, and what would then exist below (a quartz- or silica-rich layer mixed with negatively buoyant plagioclase) would largely be unpreserved after a cumulate mantle overturn initiated from a dense ilmenite-bearing cumulate (IBC). Our findings suggest that extended equilibrium crystallization of the LMO is one possible pathway to achieve a crustal thickness more in alignment with the GRAIL-based range, and that a thin lunar crust by itself would not necessarily imply, say, the presence of abundant water, which is expected to delay the onset of plagioclase crystallization (e.g. Lin et al., 2020), but for which there is little sample evidence. The findings also point to the need for further consideration of what environmental conditions would have been in place just after the Moon-forming impact to promote a prolonged period of LMO crystal suspension.



Figure 13. Modified from Charlier et al. (2018). A comparison of phase appearances as a function of % LMO solidified. Pig = pigeonite, a low-Ca variety of cpx, has been left as a separate pyroxene species when indicated as such by the original work. E+F = the two-stage model, F = fractional crystallization. Numbers in brackets indicate the LMO depth that was modeled. * = one value within an approximate range of 40 ± -5 km. ** = FeO wt.% of 12.0,

MgO wt.5 of 33.1, and Al_2O_3 wt.% of 4.0. *** = FeO wt.% of 7.62, MgO wt.5 of 38.3, and Al_2O_3 wt.% of 3.93. For EQX50 and EQX60, the first of three crustal thickness values = all plagioclase is floated; second value = late-stage plagioclase stagnates to form an extended crust; third value = plagioclase floats only when less dense than co-existing melt.

4.2. Differences in early cumulate pile solids from differences in approaches

Not all full-depth LMO LPUM models produce orthopyroxene during initial convection. For example, our two new models, as well as those from Johnson et al. (2021), produce Al-bearing orthopyroxene early in the crystallization sequence, leaving less Al for later-formed plagioclase. The experimental works of Elardo et al. (2011) and Rapp and Draper (2018) both considered LMO base crystallization conditions in the range of ~1800°C at 4 GPa, and neither model produced orthopyroxene. The cause of discrepancies between these calculated phase equilibria and experimental models is unclear, and highlight that predictions about the composition and petrology of Moon's pre-overturn cumulate mantle are highly sensitive to model parameters and methodological choices.

The EQX60 model produced ~5% more Al-bearing orthopyroxene than the EQX50 model. In general, orthopyroxene and/or olivine saturation dominate the early cumulate mantle in all these models (Fig. 13) and is likely the primary cause for a restricted range of crustal thicknesses, despite differences in model approach or method. The most direct comparisons can be made between our models and the LPUM model of Johnson et al. (2021), who also explored the TWM composition. Although both works use a computational phase equilibria approach for a two-stage LPUM model, different approaches were used for estimating the first 50% solids precipitated. Our work used key thermodynamic properties of the melt to define an adiabat for crystallization where 50% or 60% solids precipitated simultaneously, whereas Johnson et al. (2021) chose a 50% solids path directly between and parallel to the liquidus and solidus, using mol.% as a proxy for vol.%. Consequently, a 50% equilibrium crystallization regime produced different phase proportions (~45 mol.% opx and 55 mol.% ol for Johnson et al., and ~20 vol.% opx and ~80 vol.% ol for this work). Such differences are potentially significant, yet often viewed as generally similar. For example, thermodynamic output for this work at $P \sim 44000$ GPa and T ~2040 K for an LPUM composition shows olivine at ~34 vol.% with an equivalent mol.% of 43. At surface P and T, olivine output is ~55 mol.%, or ~42 vol.%. How these differences eventually translate to a full model was beyond this scope of this work, with the larger issue being that untangling the effects of parameter choices and modeling approaches on results is not straightforward. Computational phase equilibria modeling does provide an efficient and inexpensive means for investigating planetary cooling, permitting inquiry into higher P-T space than some experimental techniques. For more robust results, computational methods should be combined with experimental verification, all using the same parameters when possible.

The appearance of garnet during the end of the equilibrium crystallization portion in the EQX60 model shows that an Earth-like BSMC is capable of producing minor amounts garnet when convection is vigorous, and so an Al-enriched BSMC like TWM may not be required. The presence of garnet has been invoked to explain sound velocities and high seismic velocities in the Moon's lower mantle (Anderson, 1975; Weber et al., 2011; Wood et al., (2024). Bhanot et al. (2024) found potential relict garnet signatures in the form of Cr-spinel+olivine symplectites that

may once have been olivine+Cr-garnet, stirred up from the base of the mantle during a mantle overturn. We therefore consider garnet to be a potential lunar mantle phase resulting from the convective conditions of the early LMO.

4.3. Cumulate pile fronts and the IBC layer: potential effects on a mantle overturn

LMO models inevitably produce ilmenite as LMO solidification proceeds, and with continued ilmenite crystallization the LMO dregs eventually become Fe-depleted and silica saturated according to some models (Fig. 12). As ilmenite is considered a key component of the IBC which drove late-stage mantle mixing (i.e. CMO), its first appearance and volumetric distribution remain of interest. The CMO would have forced an exchange of material between the KREEP-bearing IBC layer and the high-Mg cumulate mantle pile below it. This exchange serves as a possible mechanism for enigmatic Mg-suite magmatism (e.g. Elkins-Tanton et al., 2002; Elardo et al., 2011; Prissel et al., 2023), rendering pre-CMO stratigraphy as a highly relevant.

For example, prolonged early LMO convection places the final cumulate pile height 80-km closer to the surface (~260 km versus 340 km for the EQX50 model). The first appearance of ilmenite in both models occurs at 90% LMO solids, similar to Johnson et al. (2021; and models referenced therein), earlier than the fully fractional LPUM model of Rapp and Draper (2018) at 97% solids, and slightly later than the relatively Fe-enriched (non-LPUM; 12 wt.% FeO) deep-LMO model of Elkins-Tanton et al. (2011) at ~88% LMO solids. The thicknesses of the IBC for both EQX50 and EQX60 models are similar at 58-59 km and ilmenite volumes also similar at 2.1-2.2 vol.%., the latter in general agreement with that of Elardo et al. (2011; ~3.6 vol.% ilmenite).

Our work supports the idea that full-depth, two-stage LPUM LMO models promote volumetrically low ilmenite production, consequently leading to shallow CMOs. However, the first appearance of ilmenite at the base of the cumulate pile front occurs relatively sooner (deeper) in the EQX50 model at a depth of ~93 km versus ~88 km in the EQX60 model, suggesting that extended LMO convection model could cause a relative delay in the onset of a CMO. When coupled with a smaller separation distance (172 km versus 247 km) between the base of the IBC and the top of a well-mixed high-Mg cumulate mantle pile, extended convection provides a physically shorter path for accessing high-Mg cumulates. While the values above are particular to the parameter definitions of the two models, we underscore that the goal is to show potentially significant, systematic changes can result from small changes in early convective vigor. The volume of ilmenite that crystallizes, the thickness and viscosity of the IBC layer, and the rheology of the mantle at the time of overturn are all crucial aspects of the CMO that remain poorly constrained (e.g. Li et al., 2019).

4.4. Upper mantle composition

Melosh et al. (2017) suggested that the impact that created the 2500-km diameter South Pole-Aitkin (SPA) basin on the Moon's southern farside likely excavated the upper lunar mantle to depths of ~100 km. Combined with compositional remote sensing data, they concluded that the upper mantle is largely composed of low-calcium pyroxene (LCP). In both models in this work, clinopyroxene (mostly low-Ca augite) dominates upper mantle composition from ~100-km depth to the base of the crust, and negligible amounts of olivine are present. Other works have concluded orthopyroxene-rich upper mantle sources, most recently from Chang'e-5 mission samples collected from the nearside in the northwest portion of the Procellarum KREEP Terrane (Sheng et al., 2024). However, spectral signatures on the lunar surface at different locales hint at different mantle lithologies – while Melosh et al. and Yamamoto et al. (2023) both concluded that LCP exposures dominate the SPA region, Yamamoto et al. also show that olivine is the dominant exposed mafic phase in other basins such as Crisium (nearside) and Moscoviense (farside). More likely, the lunar mantle is both laterally and vertically heterogeneous (as previously suggested by numerous works), whether induced by cumulate mantle mixing or by initially heterogeneous solidification processes, or both. The latter point goes back to the issue of the lunar crustal dichotomy – either the Moon's crust initially formed in a hemispherically-bound and variably-thick state or was preferentially thinned out on the nearside after formation.

4.5. Moving away from a uniformly cooling LMO: the case for a dichotomously solidifying Moon

One shared parameter across all two-stage and fully fractionating LMO models is the assumption of a symmetrically and uniformly cooling LMO. Based on current estimates that combine gravity observations with nearside crustal measurements, the farside crust is markedly thicker (up to ~60 km) than the nearside crust (20–30 km) with a global mean thickness (34-43 km) similar to that of Earth (Wieczorek et al. 2013). Previous works have explored the potential origins for the lunar crustal dichotomy, ranging from radiogenic heat contributions (Elardo et al. 2020), to a large nearside impact (Zhu et al. 2019), and to the early influence of a hot Earth (Roy et al. 2014). Roy et al. proffered that a post-impact debris disk of 2000–10000 K would influence crustal thickness if the Moon became tidally locked early on, and Lock et al. (2020, 2018) suggested that a different hot post-impact Earth structure at an ~2300 K external disk temperature must affect lunar magma ocean cooling. In addition, reflectance spectra suggest that the farside crust may have evolved from more primitive magma, as evidenced by a higher magnesium-to-iron ratio (Ohtake et al. 2012). This evidence reinforces the possibility that the Moon's crust may have initially formed in an asymmetric state.

Boukaré et al. (2022) offered a model for planetary cooling that captures the above, that a planet tidally locked to its sun could exist in a partially molten state with a solid region on the side facing away from the sun and a molten region on the sun-facing side. Given this model for paired tidal locking and crystallization, our model results and those of similar full-depth LMO works (e.g. Fig.13), we suggest the possibility that spherically uniform LMO solidification models may actually reflect the generation of the Moon's farside crustal thickness more so than a global mean, accounting for some of the discrepancy between GRAIL-based estimates and model-predicted ones. This conclusion is drawn in part from the extreme differences in crustal thickness between the lunar farside (up to ~60 km) and the nearside (20-30 km) (Wieczorek et al., 2013). A lunar nearside tidally locked to hot post-impact Earth at the onset of LMO solidification would have endured surface temperatures initially hovering above the liquidus such that crystallization would be suppressed at depth and convection weak. Figure 14 shows such a scenario. Assuming that tidal locking occurs early, the Moon is outside the Roche radius, and the external disk temperature is >2300 K, the colder lunar farside crystallizes in a manner similar to the models in this work. The nearside experiences weaker convection as the temperature differential between

LMO base and surface is initially small. There would be some communication between hemispheres, but hemispheric differences in magma ocean depth and crystallization styles would be likely (Boukaré et al., 2022).



Figure 14. Schematic showing a dual cooling regime for an LMO with two different surface temperatures and similar core-mantle boundary (CMB) temperatures. The nearside surface temperatures are 1) approximately equal to internal mantle temperatures or 2) greater than internal mantle temperatures. Condition 2 will increase depression of the adiabat-liquidus intersection compared to 1, rendering convection minimal to negligible. We assume post-impact hot Earth effective geometries (based on the synestia model of Lock et al. (2020)) are roughly spherical and are scaled at ~3.7x the radius of the Moon.

5. Conclusion

Variations in petrological structure from LMO models result from a combination of different approaches (i.e. experimental versus numerical), LMO parameters (e.g. LMO depth, *P-T* values for crystallization, model resolution), and assumptions about an initial thermal state. The general effects of varying some parameters may be arrived at more intuitively (such as increases in bulk FeO are likely to lead to increased ilmenite production and perhaps a denser late-stage melt) than others (i.e. changes in early convection can affect crustal thickness). Without a systematic variation of model parameters, however, comparing results across different works becomes problematic. Even LMO model resolution (i.e. the number of shells or layers) can lead to differences in petrological structure. An extreme example would be the instantaneous freezing of the Moon (i.e. a one-shell approach). Reverting to an LPUM pseudosection (Fig. 3) to estimate the petrology and stratigraphy, there would be no plagioclase-dominant lithology serving as a pseudo-crust and garnet would occupy the lower ~1200 km of a pseudo-mantle.

Whereas previous LPUM LMO works produce the first 50% solids as largely Mg-rich olivine and/or orthopyroxene with similar bulk densities, our models introduce the effects on early whole-Moon differentiation by extending the volume of early crystal suspension to a plausible 60% solids. The models suggest that garnet in the lunar mantle is possible without having to invoke an alumina-enriched BSM. This finding is not to be taken as proof or even likelihood of mantle garnet due to persistent early convection. Rather, we suggest that convective vigor coupled with, say, a minor increase in alumina may provide another means for creating mantle garnet.

LMO models that produce late-stage silica-rich melts must contend with the effects on plagioclase floatation. We find this consideration lacking in the literature. Current seismic interpretations of the lunar farside are based on nearside-placed seismometers, and so future seismic missions will likely lead to reassessments of lunar crustal thickness, forcing re-examinations of previous LMO works. That a vigorously convecting LMO favors a thinner crust (among other traits) than conventional 50%-solid two-stage models is, to our knowledge, a novel finding that reinforces the importance of convective styles for modeling the building of small rocky bodies.

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Kim Cone: Writing – Original draft, Writing – Review and Editing, Conceptualization, Methodology, Formal Analysis, Visualization, Funding acquisition, Data curation. Stephen Elardo: Methodology, Review and Editing. Frank Spera: Methodology, Visualization, Writing – Original Draft, Writing – Review and Editing. Wendy Bohrson: Methodology, Writing – review and editing. Richard Palin: Conceptualization, Methodology, Resources, Writing – Review and Editing, Supervision.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare no competing interests. This research was conducted without any commercial or financial relationships that could be perceived as a potential conflict of interest.

Acknowledgments

The authors wish to acknowledge funding and support from the Geological Society of America through a GSA Graduate Student Geoscience Grant #13410-22 funded by NSF Award #1949901, and an NSF-supported IIE-GIRE Fellowship under Grant #1829436. We thank Andrea Distel at Arizona State University for assistance with editing, A. Nemchin and an anonymous reviewer for their helpful reviews, and Editor-in-Chief Alessandro Morbidelli for editorial handling.

Open Research

Supporting data for this manuscript are available at the GitHub repository at https://github.com/warprin/Icarus_LMO-models.

References

- Abe, Y. (1995). Early evolution of the terrestrial planets. Journal of Physics of the Earth, 43, 515-532. https://www.jstage.jst.go.jp/article/jpe1952/43/4/43_4_515/_pdf
- Anderson, D.L. (1975). On the Composition of the lunar interior. Journal of Geophysical Research, 80, 148-227. https://doi.org/10.1029/JB080i011p01555
- Bhanot, K.K., Downes, H, Rider-Stokes, B.G. (2024). A reappraisal of the petrogenesis of Apollo 17 lunar dunites. Meteoritics and Planetary Science, 59, 3129-3149. https://doi.org/10.1111/maps.14269
- Boukaré, C-E., Parmentier, E.M., Parman, S.W. (2017). Did lunar mantle ocean overturn before the end of magma ocean solidification? LPSC XLVII, abstract 2494. https://www.hou.usra.edu/meetings/lpsc2017/pdf/2494.pdf
- Boukaré, C-E., Cowan, N.B., Badro, J. (2022). Deep two-phase, hemispherical magma oceans on lava planets. The Astrophysical Journal, 936, 9pp. https://doi.org/10.3847/1538-4357/ac8792
- Canup, R.M., Asphaug, E. (2001). Origin of the Moon in a giant impact near the end of the Earth's formation. Nature, 412, 708-712. https://doi.org/10.1038/35089010
- Canup R.M. (2004). Simulations of a late lunar-forming impact. Icarus, 168, 433-466. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2003.09.028
- Charlier, B., Grove, T.L., Namur, O., Holtz, F. (2018). Crystallization of the lunar magma ocean and the primordial mantle-crust differentiation of the Moon. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 234, 50-69. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2018.05.006.
- Cone, K. (2021). ApolloBasalt DB_V2, Version Version 1.0. Interdisciplinary Earth Data Alliance (IEDA).
- Cone, K.A., Palin, R.M., Singha, K. (2020). Unsupervised machine learning with petrological database ApolloBasaltDB reveals complexity in lunar basalt major element oxide and mineral distribution patterns. Icarus, 346, 113787. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2020.113787
- Costa, A., Caricchi, L., Bagdassarov, N. (2009). A model for the rheology of particle-bearing suspensions and partially molten rocks. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 10, 2785-2806. https://doi.org/10.1029/2008GC002138
- Connolly, J.A.D. (2005). Computation of phase equilibria by linear programming: A tool for geodynamic modeling and its application to subduction zone decarbonation. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 236 (1-2), 524–541. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2005.04.033

- Connolly, J.A.D. (2009). The geodynamic equation of state: what and how. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 10, Q10014. https://doi.org/10.1029/2009GC002540
- Cuk, M., Stewart. (2012). Making the Moon from a fast-spinning Earth: A giant impact followed by resonant despinning. Science, 1047-1052. https://doi:0.1126/science.1225542
- Dauphas, N., Burkhardt, C., Warren, P.H., Fang-Zhen, T. (2014). Geochemical arguments for an Earth-like Moon-forming impactor. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A, 372, 20130244. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2013.0244
- Elardo, S.M., Draper, D.S., Shearer, C.K. (2011). Lunar magma ocean crystallization revisited: bulk composition, early cumulate mineralogy, and the source regions of the highlands Mg-suite. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 75, 3024-3045. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2011.02.033
- Elardo, S.M., Laneuville, M., McCubbin, F.M, Shearer, C.K. (2020). Early crust building enhanced on the Moon's nearside by mantle melting-point depression. Nature Geoscience, 13, 339-343. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-020-0559-4
- Elkins-Tanton, L.T., Van Orman, J.A., Hager, B.H., Grove, T.L. (2002). Re-examination of the lunar magma ocean cumulate overturn hypothesis: melting or mixing is required. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 196, 239-249. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0012-821X(01)00613-6
- Elkins-Tanton, L.T. (2012). Magma oceans in the inner solar system. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Science, 40, 113-139. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-earth-042711-105503
- Elkins-Tanton, L.T., Burgess, S., Yin, Q-Z. (2011). The lunar magma ocean: reconciling the solidification process with lunar petrology and geochronology. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 304, 326-336. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2011.02.004
- Elkins-Tanton, L.T. (2008). Linked magma ocean solidification and atmospheric growth for Earth and Mars. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 271, 181-191. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2008.03.062
- Garcia, R.F., Khan, A., Drilleau, M., Margerin, L., Kawamura, T., Sun, D., et al. (2019). Lunar Seismology: An Update on Interior Structure Models. Space Science Reviews, 215. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11214-019-0613-y
- Green, E.C.R., White, R.W., Diener, J.F.A., Powell, R., Holland, T.J.B., Palin, R.M. (2016). Activity–composition relations for the calculation of partial melting equilibria in metabasic rocks. Journal of Metamorphic Geology, 34, 845-869. https://doi.org/10.1111/jmg.12211

- Hart, S.R., Zindler, A. (1986). In search of bulk-Earth composition. Chemical Geology, 57, 247-267. https://doi.org/10.1016/0009-2541(86)90053-7
- Hauri, E.H., Saal, A.E., Rutherford, M.J., Van Orman, J.A. (2015). Water in the Moon: Truth and Consequences. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 409, 252-264. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2014.10.053
- Holland, T.J.B., Green, E.C., Powell, R. (2018). Melting of peridotites through to granites: A simple thermodynamic model in the system KNCFMASHTOCr. Journal of Petrology, 59, 881-900. https://doi.org/10.1093/petrology/egy048
- Holland, T.J.B., Powell, R. (2011). An improved and extended internally consistent thermodynamic dataset for phases of petrological interest, involving a new equation of state for solids. Journal of Metamorphic Geology, 29, 333-383. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1525-1314.2010.00923.x
- Hurwitz, D. M., D. A. Kring. (2014). Differentiation of the South Pole–Aitken basin impact melt sheet: Implications for lunar exploration, Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 119, 1110-1133. https://doi:10.1002/2013JE004530.
- Jennings, E.S., Holland, T.J.B. (2015). A simple thermodynamic model for melting of peridotite in the system NCFMASOCr. Journal of Petrology, 56, 869-892. https://doi.org/10.1093/petrology/egv020
- Jing, J-J., Lin, Y., Knibbe, J.S., van Westrenen, W. (2022). Garnet stability in the deep lunar mantle: Constraints on the physics and chemistry of the interior of the Moon. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 584, 117491. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2022.117491
- Johnson, T.E., Morrissey, L.J., Nemchin, A.A., Gardiner, N.J., Snape, J.F. (2021). The phases of the Moon: Modelling crystallisation of the lunar magma ocean through equilibrium thermodynamics. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 556, 116721. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2020.116721
- Kraettli, G., Schmidt, M.W., Liebske, C. (2002). Garnet stability in the deep lunar mantle: Constraints on the physics and chemistry of the interior of the Moon. EPSL, 584, 117491. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2022.117491
- Li, H., Zhang, N., Liang, Y., Wu, B., Dygert, N.J., Huang, J., Parmentier, E.M. (2019). Luna r cumulate mantle overturn: A model constrained by ilmenite rheology. Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 124, 1357-1378. https://doi.org/10.1029/2018JE005905
- Lin, Y., Tronche, E.J., Steenstra, E.S., van Westrenen, W. (2017). Experimental constraints on the solidification of a nominally dry lunar magma ocean. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 471, 104-116. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2017.04.045

- Lin, Y., Hui, H., Xia, X., Shang, S., van Westrenen, W. (2019). Experimental constraints on the solidification of a hydrous lunar magma ocean. Meteoritics and Planetary Science, 55, 207-230. https://doi.org/10.1111/maps.13425
- Lock S.J., Stewart S.T., Cuk, M. (2020). The energy budget and figure of Earth during recovery from the Moon-forming giant impact. Earth and Planetary Science Letters. 530, 115885. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2019.115885
- Lock S.J., Stewart S.T., Petaev, M.I., Leinhardt, Z.M., Mace, M.T., Jacobsen, S. B., Cuk, M. (2018). The origin of the Moon within a terrestrial synestia. Journal of Geophysical Research, 123, 910-951. https://doi.org/10.1002/2017JE005333
- Longhi J. (2006). Petrogenesis of picritic mare magmas: Constraints on the extent of early lunar differentiation. Geochimica Cosmochimica Acta, 70, 5919-5934. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2006.09.023
- Maurice, M., Tosi, N., Schwinger, S., Breuer, D., Kleine, T. (2020). A long-lived magma ocean on a young Moon. Science Advances, 6, eaba8949. https://doi.org/10.1126/sciadv.aba8949
- McDonough, W.F., Sun, S.-s. (1995). The composition of the Earth. Chemical Geology, 120, 223-253. https://doi.org/10.1016/0009-2541(94)00140-4
- Melosh, H.J., Kendall, J., Horgan, B., Johnson, B.C., Bowling, T., Lucey, P.G., Taylor, G.J. (2017). South Pole–Aitken basin ejecta reveal the Moon's upper mantle. Geology, 45, 1063-1066. https://doi.org/10.1130/G39375.1
- Moriarty, D.P., Dygert, N., Valencia, S.N., Watkins, R.N., Petro, N.E. (2021). The search for lunar mantle rocks exposed on the surface of the Moon. Nature Communications, 12, 795-800. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-021-24626-3
- Palin, R.M., Weller, O.M., Waters, D.J., Dyck, B. (2016). Quantifying geological uncertainty in metamorphic phase equilibria modelling; a Monte Carlo assessment and implications for tectonic interpretations. Geoscience Frontiers, 7, 591-607. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gsf.2015.08.005
- Panning, M.P., Kedar, S., Bowles., N., Bugby, D., Calcutt, S., Elliott, J., et al. (2022). Farside Seismic Suite (FSS): Surviving the lunar night and delivering the first seismic data from the farside of the Moon. Abstract presented at the 53rd Lunar and Planetary Science Conference, Houston, TX.
- Papike, J.J., Karner J.M., Shearer, C.K. (2005). Comparative planetary mineralogy: valence state partitioning of Cr, Fe, Ti, and V among crystallographic sites in olivine, pyroxene, and spinel from planetary basalts. American Mineralogist, 90, 277-290. https://doi.org/10.2138/am.2005.1779

- Powell, R., Holland, T.J.B. (2008). On thermobarometry. Journal of Metamorphic Geology, 26, 155-179. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1525-1314.2007.00756.x
- Prissel, T.C., Zhang, N., Jackson, C.R.M., Li, H. (2023). Rapid transition from primary to secondary crust building on the Moon explained by mantle overturn. Nature Communications, 14, 11 pp. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-023-40751-7
- Quillen, A.C., Martini, L., Nakajima, M. (2019). Near/far side asymmetry in the tidally heated Moon. Icarus, 329, 182–196. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2019.04.010
- Rapp, J.F., Draper, D.S. (2018). Fractional crystallization of the lunar magma ocean: Updating the dominant paradigm. Meteoritics and Planetary Science, 53, 1432-1455. https://doi.org/10.1111/maps.13086
- Roy, A., Wright, J.T., Sigurdsson, S. (2014). Earthshine on a young Moon: Explaining the lunar farside highlands. The Astrophysical Journal Letters, 788, L42. https://10.1088/2041-8205/788/2/L42
- Sato M., Hickling N.L., McLane, J.E. (1973). Oxygen fugacity values of Apollo 12, 14, and 15 lunar samples and reduced state of lunar magmas. Proceedings of the Lunar Science Conference, 4, 1061-1079.
- Schmidt, M.W. Kraettli, G. (2022). Experimental crystallization of the lunar magma ocean, initial selenotherm and density stratification, and implications for crust formation, overturn and the bulk silicate Moon composition. JGR: Planets, 127, e2022JE007187. https://doi.org/10.1029/2022JE007187
- Schwinger, S., Breuer, D. (2022). Employing magma ocean crystallization models to constrain structure and composition of the lunar interior. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 322, 106831. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pepi.2021.106831
- Sheng, S-Z., Su, B., Wang, S-J., Chen, Y., Li, Q-L., Wang, H., Hui, H., Wu, S., Zhang, B., Yuan, J-Y. (2024). Orthopyroxene-dominated upper mantle melting built the early crust of the Moon. Communications Earth and Environment, 5. https://doi.org/10.1038/s43247-024-01574-6
- Snyder, G.A., Taylor, L.A., Neal, C.R. (1992). A chemical model for generating the sources of mare basalts: combined equilibrium and fractional crystallization of the lunar magmasphere. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 56, 3809-3823. https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(92)90172-F
- Solomatov, V.S. (2000). Fluid dynamics of a terrestrial magma ocean. In: Origin of the Earth and Moon, Canup, R.M., Righter, K. (eds.), The University of Arizona Press, Tucson, AZ.
- Solomatov, V.S. (2007). Magma oceans and primordial mantle differentiation. In D.J. Stevenson (Ed.), Treatise on Geophysics, Vol. 9: Evolution of the Earth, 91-119.

- Spera, F.J. (1992). Lunar magma transport phenomena. Geochimica Cosmochimica Acta, 56, 2253-2265. https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(92)90187-N
- Taylor, S.R. (1982). Planetary science: A lunar perspective. Houston, TX: Lunar and Planetary Institute.
- Tonks, W.B., Melosh, H.J. (1990). The physics of crystal settling and suspension in a turbulent magma ocean. In H.E. Newsom, J.H. Jones (Eds.), Origin of the Earth, 151-74.
- Turcotte, D., Schubert, G. (2002). Geodynamics, 2nd Ed., Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Warren, P.H. (1985). The magma ocean concept and lunar evolution. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Science, 13, 201-240. https://doi:10.1146/annurev.ea.13.050185.001221
- Weber, R.C., Lin, P.Y., Garnero, E.J., Williams, Q., Lognonne, P. (2011). Seismic detection of the lunar core. Science, 33, 309-312. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1199375
- White, R.W., Powell, R., Holland, T.J.B., Johnson, T.E., Green, E.C.R. (2014). Progress relating to calculation of partial melting equilibria for metapelites. Journal of Metamorphic Geology, 25, 511-527. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1525-1314.2007.00711.x
- White, R.W., Powell, R., Holland, T J.B., Worley, B. A. (2000). The effect of TiO₂ and Fe₂O₃ on metapelitic assemblages at greenschist and amphibolite facies conditions: mineral equilibria calculations in the system K₂O–FeO–MgO–Al₂O₃–SiO₂–H₂O–TiO₂–Fe₂O₃. Journal of Metamorphic Geology, 18, 497-511. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1525-1314.2000.00269.x
- Wieczorek, M.A., Neumann, G.A., Nimmo, F., Kiefer, W.S., Taylor, G.J., Melosh, H.J., et al. (2013). The crust of the Moon as seen by GRAIL. Science, 339, 671-675. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1231530
- Williams, J.G., Konopliv, A.S., Boggs, D.H., Park, R.S., Yuan, D-N., Lemoine, F.G., et al. (2014). Lunar interior properties from the GRAIL mission. Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 119, 1546-1578. https://doi.org/10.1002/2013JE004559
- Wood, M.C., Gréaux, S., Kono, Y., Kakizawa, S., Ishikawa, Y., Inoué, S., et al. (2024). Sound velocities in lunar mantle aggregates at simultaneous high pressures and temperatures: Implications for the presence of garnet in the deep lunar interior. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 641, 118792. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2024.118792
- Yamamoto, S., Nagaoka, H., Ohtake, M., Kayama, M., Karouji, Y., Ishihara, Y., Haruyama, J. (2023). Lunar mantle composition based on spectral and geologic analysis of low-Ca pyroxene- and olivine-rich rocks exposed on the lunar surface. Journal of

Geophysical Research: Planets, 128, e2023JE007817. https://doi.org/10.1029/2023JE007817

- Zhu, M.-H., Wünnemann, K., Potter, R.W.K., Kleine, T., Morbidelli, A. (2019). Are the Moon's nearside-farside asymmetries the result of a giant impact? Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 124, 2117-2140. https://doi.org/10.1029/2018JE005826
- Zhao, Y., de Vries, J., van den Berg, A.P., Jacobs, M.H.G., van Westrenen, W. (2019). The participation of ilmenite-bearing cumulates in lunar mantle overturn. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 511, 1-11. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2019.01.022

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare no competing interests. This research was conducted without any commercial or financial relationships that could be perceived as a potential conflict of interest.

Sonution

Highlights

- Phase equilibria models simulate complete solidification of the lunar magma ocean
- Changes in internal stratigraphy are examined due to a change in early convection
- A vigorously convecting LMO promotes a thinner crust and mantle garnet
- An Al-rich bulk composition is not required to produce garnet as previously suggested
- Plagioclase does not always float, especially in the presence of quartz-saturated melts

outro control of the second se